Earth's formation & core-mantle differentiation

Maylis Landeau¹,

¹ Institut de Physique du Globe de Paris,

Summary & open questions

The age of the Earth

Lord Kelvin, 1863, *On the secular cooling of the Earth*, Philos. Mag. 4th series, Vol. 25, 1-14.



Summary & open questions

The age of the Earth

Lord Kelvin, 1863, *On the secular cooling of the Earth*, Philos. Mag. 4th series, Vol. 25, 1-14.



Summary & open questions

The age of the Earth

Lord Kelvin, 1863, *On the secular cooling of the Earth*, Philos. Mag. 4th series, Vol. 25, 1-14.



Summary & open questions

The age of the Earth

Lord Kelvin, 1863, *On the secular cooling of the Earth*, Philos. Mag. 4th series, Vol. 25, 1-14.





Cooling by conduction of a semi-infinite half-plane

$$\frac{\partial T}{\partial t} = \kappa \frac{\partial^2 T}{\partial z^2}$$

Age of the Earth ~ 100 Myr...

The age of the Earth: Using radiogenic isotopes

The Pb²⁰⁷/Pb²⁰⁶ ages of some stone meteorites

CLAIRE C. PATTERSON California Institute of Technology, Pasadena, California

(Received 10 January 1955)

ABSTRACT

The isotopic compositions have been determined for the leads isolated from three stone meteorites. Based upon certain assumptions, $Pb^{\mu\sigma}/Pb^{\nu\sigma}$ ages of about 4.5 × 10⁹ years are calculated for the meteorites. The lead data indicate that the concentrations of turanium should be about 0-1 p.p.m. and the concentrations of thorium should be about 0-5 p.p.m. in stone meteorites.

Patterson, 1955, Geochimica et Cosmochica Acta
↓
Age of solar system ~ 4.57 Gyr



Claire Patterson

Summary & open questions

The age of the Earth: Using radiogenic isotopes

The Pb²⁰⁷/Pb²⁰⁶ ages of some stone meteorites

CLAIRE C. PATTERSON California Institute of Technology, Pasadena, California

(Received 10 January 1955)

ABSTRACT

The isotopic compositions have been determined for the leads isolated from three stone meteorites. Based upon certain assumptions, Pb^{207}/Pb^{206} ages of about 4.5×10^9 years are calculated for the meteorites. The lead data indicate that the concentrations of uranium should be about 0.1 p.p.m. and the concentrations of thorium should be about 0.5 p.p.m. in stone meteorites.



Claire Patterson



Earth formation controls core & mantle evolution



Earth formation controls core & mantle evolution



Geochemical constraints

Physical constraints

Summary & open questions



Geochemical constraints

Physical constraints

Summary & open questions





Extinct radioactivity: timing of core formation

 $^{182}\text{Hf} \rightarrow {}^{182}\text{W}$

Key properties: Both Hf and W are refractory. Hf is lithophile while W is siderophile. Half-life of 8.9Myrs.

Principles on the blackboard for a two stage accretion model.



Chondrite (P. Thomas)

Extinct radioactivity: timing of core formation



Geochemical constraints

Physical constraints

Summary & open questions

Extinct radioactivity: timing of core formation



Two-stage time scale of most iron meteorites < 1.5 Myr after CAI

Kleine et al. 2005

Hoba iron meteorite, Namibia, > 60 tonnes

Principles :

• Partition coefficient of element i between metal and silicates:

$$D_i = \frac{C_i^{\text{metal}}}{C_i^{\text{silicates}}} \tag{1}$$

- Composition of the global Earth from chondrites
 - Mantle composition from upper mantle rocks (Bulk Silicate Earth)
 - ightarrow Composition of the core

$$D_{i,Earth} = rac{C_i^{core}}{C_i^{mantle}}$$

• $D_i = D_i$ (Pressure, Temperature, Oxygen fugacity)

(2)

Geochemical constraints

Physical constraints

Summary & open questions

Siderophile elements: Temperature & pressure





• 1 - Obtaining partition coefficient $\log (D_i) = a + \frac{b}{T} + \frac{cP}{T}$, where a, b and c are estimated from high-pressure experiments.



 $O_{O}^{25} O_{O}^{15} O_{O}^{15$

• 2 - Finding pressure & temperature such that $D_i = D_{Earth}$.



in a 1000-1500 km deep magma ocean

in a 1000-1500 km deep magma ocean

Siderophile elements: Temperature & pressure



What if partial equilibration ?

Partial metal-silicate equilibration

$$^{182}Hf \rightarrow^{182} W$$



Degree of equilibration = <u>Mass exchanged</u> Max. mass exchanged

Partial metal-silicate equilibration

 $^{182}Hf \rightarrow ^{182}W$ 1.0 0.9 mantle Degree of equilibration 0.8 0.7 0.6 0.5 0.4 0.3 0.2 0.1 0 20 60 80 100 120 140 160 180 200 0 40 Duration of core formation from Hf/W isotopic data Rudge et al., 2010, Nature

Degree of equilibration = <u>Mass exchanged</u> <u>Max. mass exchanged</u>

The duration of core formation, deduced from isotopic observations, strongly depends on the assumed degree of equilibration

Summary & open questions







Physical processes: length & time scales



Physical processes: length & time scales



Physical processes: length & time scales



At the disk scale : Accretion stages



Protoplanetary disk scale : planetesimals to planets



Protoplanetary disk scale : planetesimals to planets



At the planetary scale : Impacts & heating



At the planetary scale : Impacts & heating



At the planetary scale : Impacts

Formation of the Moon

Courtesy of Miki Nakajima, Univ. of Rochester

At the planetary scale : Impacts

Standard Moon-forming scenarios do not easily explain :the angular momentum of Earth-Moon.& the high isotopic similarities of Earth & Moon.Zhang et al. 2012



Proposed Moon-forming impact scenarios

Nakajima & Stevenson, 2015

At the planetary scale : Impacts



Synestia

Lock et al. 2018


At the planetary scale : Heating & melting



At the planetary scale : Heating & melting



Sub-planetary scale: Metal-silicate differentiation



Sub-planetary scale: Metal-silicate differentiation









Nakajima & Stevenson, 2015

Metal-silicate equilibration: numerical simulations



Ulvrová et al. 2011

Lherm & Deguen 2018

Metal-silicate equilibration: numerical simulations



Cameron, 2000 Canup, 2004, 2012 Nakajima & Stevenson, 2015

Metal-silicate equilibration: lab experiments

Turbulent plume, $We = inertia / surface tension \sim 2 \times 10^3$ Deguen et al. 2014, Landeau et al. 2014

Summary & open questions

Metal-silicate equilibration: Turbulent plume



Turbulent plume, $We = inertia/surface tension \sim 10^3$ Landeau et al. AGU 2020

• Drop size $\sim We^{-3/5}$ for homogeneous turbulence. (*Hinze, 1955*)



- Drop size $\sim We^{-3/5}$ for homogeneous turbulence. (*Hinze*, 1955)
- Metal in magma ocean: Drops $\lesssim 1~\text{mm}$. Diffusion length $\sim 10~\text{mm}$.



- Drop size $\sim We^{-3/5}$ for homogeneous turbulence. (*Hinze*, 1955)
- Metal in magma ocean: Drops $\lesssim 1~{\rm mm}$. Diffusion length $\sim 10~{\rm mm}$.

 \rightarrow Chemical equilibration of the entire impactor core.

 \rightarrow But only with entrained silicates.



How much entrained silicates during impact?

Landeau et al., EPSL, 2021 Lherm et al., submitted

Summary & open questions

How much entrained silicates during impact?



Kendall & Melosh, 2016

Landeau et al., EPSL, 2021 Lherm et al., submitted

How much entrained silicates during impact?



Landeau et al., EPSL, 2021 Lherm et al., submitted



Total volume, V

↓

Entrained dimensionless volume,

$$V_e = \frac{V - V_0}{V_0}$$

 V_0 : impactor volume



Froude, $Fr = U^2/gR$

 $V_e = \frac{V - V_0}{V_0}$

 V_0 : impactor volume



Froude, $Fr = U^2/gR$

 $V_e = \frac{V - V_0}{V_0}$

 V_0 : impactor volume



Entrained dimensionless volume,

$$V_e = \frac{V - V_0}{V_0}$$

 V_0 : impactor volume



Froude, $Fr = U^2/gR$

Metal-silicate mixing as a function of impact velocity & impactor size



$$V_e = \frac{V - V_0}{V_0}$$

 V_0 : impactor volume



Entrained silicates following impact



Deguen et al. 2014



From entrained silicates to the degree of metal-silicate equilibration



Summary: Earth formation, a young field that needs geochemistry & physics



Coupling a wide range of time and length scales



Physical constraints

Summary & open questions

Open questions & next steps on Earth formation



Impactor core fragments into drops, but at what depth? During the impact?

Poster by Augustin Maller



meteor crater (Arizona, USA)

Open questions & next steps on Earth formation

Magma ocean: Origin of primordial heterogeneities in Earth's mantle? Impacts?

Mundl et al. 2020 Touboul et al. 2012



Open questions & next steps on Earth formation

• Moon-formation: impact scenario that explains compositional similarity between Earth & Moon?



Hosono et al. 2019

Open questions & next steps on Earth formation Composition of Earth-forming impactors?

Planetesimals formed before 1 Myr

↓ Melting of silicates by radioactivity (A1²⁶, Fe⁶⁰)

Kaminski et al. 2020



Chemical equilibration



Ricard et al., 2009 Differentiation in ~ 10 000 yr



Chemical equilibration ?

Open questions & next steps on Earth formation Addition of highly-siderophile elements by impacts



References:

Books & reviews on Earth formation:

Treatise of geophysics, chapter 9.01 to 9.11, Earth formation & evolution, 2007, Elsevier.

Morbidelli et al. 2012. Building terrestrial planets, Annual Review of Earth and Planetary Sciences.

Melosh, 1989. Impact cratering: A geologic process. Oxford monographs on geology and geophysics.

Extra slides

Physical constraints

Summary & open questions

From a uniform nebula to a differentiated planet


Physical constraints

Summary & open questions

From a uniform nebula to a differentiated planet



Partial metal-silicate equilibration



Depth of magma ocean deduced from siderophile elements depends on assumed physics of metal-silicate equilibration !

Extinct radioactivity: timing of core formation

Summary : Timescales for the formation of inner Solar System planets as determined from isotopic dating (*from Kleine & Rudge*, 2011)



Protoplanetary disk scale: dust to planetesimals



Protoplanetary disk scale: dust to planetesimals



Introduction

Protoplanetary disk scale : planetesimals to planets





Inward, then outward **migration** of **Jupiter & Saturn** explains:

- Size of Mars
- Water in inner solar system
- Distribution in asteroid belt

Terrestrial planets

time



Core-mantle differentiation: large impacts

Villermaux and Bossa (2009)



Core-mantle differentiation: large impacts

Villermaux and Bossa (2009)



Entrained silicates: two main stages

Short times

Long times



Froude = 18, U = 2.3 m/s

Entrained silicates: two main stages



Froude = 18, U = 2.3 m/s

Landeau et al., 2014 Deguen et al., 2014 Wacheul & Le Bars, 2017

Entrained silicates: two main stages



Summary & open questions

Entrained silicates: two main stages



Froude = 130, U = 6.2 m/s

How much ambient fluid entrained & mixed with the impactor?

Metal-silicate differentiation: large impacts



Diapirs or dykes in solid mantle

Length $\gtrsim 1$ km Karato & Murthy, 1997 Time $\gtrsim 3$ yr Length for chemical transfers $\sqrt{Dt} \sim 1$ m

No chemical equilibration

Metal-silicate differentiation: large impacts



Diapirs or dykes in solid mantle

Length $\gtrsim 1$ km Karato & Murthy, 1997 Time $\gtrsim 3$ yr Length for chemical transfers $\sqrt{Dt} \sim 1$ m

No chemical equilibration

Thermal transfers ?

Metal-silicate differentiation: large impacts





Physical constraints

Summary & open questions

Sub-planetary scale: Metal-silicate equilibration

Impact simulations









Nakajima & Stevenson, 2015 Canup, 2004, 2012

Resolution $\sim 100 \text{ km}$

Scale of chemical transfers ~ 1 cm Ichikawa et al. 2010 Kendall & Melosh, 2016

What is missing?

Small scales & Turbulence!

Core-mantle differentiation: large impacts Turbulent plume



Introduction



2 100	A		
	,,,,,		on
ιιu	Jui	uu	υII





Entrained silicates



 V_0 : impactor volume