Optimal disc and sphere packings

69 (20)

50

50

Daria Pchelina LIP, équipe MC2

50

50

SIESTE seminar 16/10/2024





Optimal coin packings

Given infinite number of identical coins (



how to place them on an infinite plane without overlap to maximize the covered surface?



Optimal coin packings

Given infinite number of identical coins (



how to place them on an infinite plane without overlap to maximize the covered surface?



Optimal coin packings

Given infinite number of identical coins (



how to place them on an infinite plane without overlap to maximize the covered surface?



1910–1940

The hexagonal coin packing is optimal.

Daria Pchelina







Daria Pchelina

Density of disc and sphere packings

2 / 24



Daria Pchelina

Density of disc and sphere packings

2 / 24

Nanomaterials and packings



Cheon et al 2006

Paik et al 2015

Nanomaterials and packings



Cheon et al 2006

Paik et al 2015



Also in 3D:

Chemists' question : which sizes and concentrations allow for new materials?



Definitions

Discs:

Packing P: (in \mathbb{R}^2)



Definitions

Discs:





Definitions







Definitions







Definitions

Discs:

Packing P: (in \mathbb{R}^2)



Definitions







Definitions

Discs:





Definitions

Discs:



Packing P: (in \mathbb{R}^2)



Density:

$$\delta(P) := \limsup_{n \to \infty} \frac{\operatorname{area}([-n, n]^2 \cap P)}{\operatorname{area}([-n, n]^2)}$$

Main Question

Given a finite set of discs (e.g., $\bigcirc \bigcirc \bullet$), what is the maximal density δ^* of a packing?

 $\delta^* := \sup_P \delta(P)$

Daria Pchelina

Density of disc and sphere packings

Optimal 2-disc packings

Theorem (Heppes 2000, 2003, Kennedy 2005, Bedaride and Fernique 2022)

Each of the following packings is optimal (densest) for discs of radii 1 and r:



Optimal 2-disc packings

Theorem (Heppes 2000, 2003, Kennedy 2005, Bedaride and Fernique 2022)

Each of the following packings is optimal (densest) for discs of radii 1 and r:



Daria Pchelina

Density of disc and sphere packings

Connelly conjecture

Triangulated packings:

Conjecture (Connelly 2018)

If a finite set of discs allows saturated triangulated packings then one of them is optimal.



triangulated saturated



non triangulated saturated



triangulated non saturated



non triangulated non saturated

Connelly conjecture

Triangulated packings:

Conjecture (Connelly 2018)

If a finite set of discs allows saturated triangulated packings then one of them is optimal.



triangulated saturated



non triangulated saturated



triangulated non saturated



non triangulated non saturated

Theorem (OO• Fernique, Hashemi, Sizova 2019)

Discs of radii 1, r and s: there are 164 pairs (r, s) allowing triangulated packings.





. . .



164 (r, s) allowing triangulated packings:

- 15 cases: non saturated
- 16+16 cases: a ternary or binary triangulated packing is densest
- 45 cases: a binary non triangulated packing is denser



Theorem (Fernique, P 2023)

Each of the following packings is optimal for discs of radii 1, r and s:









 $r\approx 0.8 s\approx 0.6 \delta^* \approx 90.9\%$









 $r \approx 0.7 \ s \approx 0.5 \ \delta^* \approx 91.1\% \ r \approx 0.7 \ s \approx 0.2 \ \delta^* \approx 93.2\% \ r \approx 0.7 \ s \approx 0.5 \ \delta^* \approx 91.5\% \ r \approx 0.8 \ s \approx 0.6 \ \delta^* \approx 91\%$





 $r\approx 0.4 s\approx 0.4 \delta^* \approx 92.2\%$ $r\approx 0.5 s\approx 0.4 \delta^* \approx 91.8\%$ $r \approx 0.5 s \approx 0.4 \delta^* \approx 91.7\% r \approx 0.8 s \approx 0.5 \delta^* \approx 91.2\%$







Daria Pchelina

Density of disc and sphere packings

FM-triangulation



Voronoi cell of a disc in a packing: set of points closer to this disc than to any other

FM-triangulation



Voronoi cell of a disc in a packing: set of points closer to this disc than to any other Voronoi diagram of a packing: partition of the plane into Voronoi cells

FM-triangulation



Voronoi cell of a disc in a packing: set of points closer to this disc than to any other Voronoi diagram of a packing: partition of the plane into Voronoi cells

FM-triangulation of a packing: dual graph of the Voronoi diagram

FM-triangulation



Voronoi cell of a disc in a packing: set of points closer to this disc than to any other Voronoi diagram of a packing: partition of the plane into Voronoi cells

FM-triangulation of a packing: dual graph of the Voronoi diagram

FM-triangulation



Voronoi cell of a disc in a packing: set of points closer to this disc than to any other Voronoi diagram of a packing: partition of the plane into Voronoi cells

FM-triangulation of a packing: dual graph of the Voronoi diagram

Density of a triangle Δ in a packing = its proportion covered by discs $\delta_{\Delta} = \frac{\operatorname{area}(\Delta \cap P)}{\operatorname{area}(\Delta)}$

Density of disc and sphere packings

FM-triangulation



Voronoi cell of a disc in a packing: set of points closer to this disc than to any other Voronoi diagram of a packing: partition of the plane into Voronoi cells

FM-triangulation of a packing: dual graph of the Voronoi diagram

Density of a triangle Δ in a packing = its proportion covered by discs $\delta_{\Delta} = \frac{\operatorname{area}(\Delta \cap P)}{\operatorname{area}(\Delta)}$

Density of disc and sphere packings

Local density redistribution





Local density redistribution





Local density redistribution



 $\delta(P) \leq \delta^*$


Local density redistribution



 $\delta(P) \leq \delta^*$



Proof:

- the smallest angle of any Δ is at least $\frac{\pi}{6}$
- thus the largest angle is between $\frac{\pi}{3}$ and $\frac{2\pi}{3}$
- density of a triangle Δ : $\delta(\Delta) = \frac{\pi/2}{area(\Delta)}$
- the area of a triangle ABC with the largest angle \hat{A} : $\frac{|AB| \cdot |AC| \cdot \sin \hat{A}}{2} \ge \frac{2 \cdot 2 \cdot \frac{\sqrt{3}}{2}}{2} = \sqrt{3}$

• thus the density of ABC is less or equal to $\frac{\pi/2}{\sqrt{3}} = \delta^*$

Daria Pchelina

Density of disc and sphere packings

 $2 > R = \frac{|AB|}{2\sin{\widehat{C}}} \ge \frac{1}{\sin{\widehat{C}}} \Longrightarrow \widehat{C} > \frac{\pi}{6}$

Local density redistribution



 $\delta(P) \leq \delta^*$





P of density $\delta(P)$



 P^* of density δ^*

Daria Pchelina

10 / 24

Local density redistribution



 $\delta(P) \leq \delta^*$





P of density $\delta(P)$

Triangles in *P*^{*} have different densities:

 $\delta\left(\bigwedge\right) < \delta^* < \delta\left(\bigwedge\right)$

Hopeless to bound the density by δ^* in each triangle...



 P^* of density δ^*

Daria Pchelina

Density of disc and sphere packings

Local density redistribution



 $\delta(P) \leq \delta^*$





P of density $\delta(P) \leq \delta'(P)$

redistributed density δ' :

dense triangles share their density with neighbors



 P^* of density δ^*

Daria Pchelina

Density of disc and sphere packings

Local density redistribution



 $\delta(P) \leq \delta^*$





P of density $\delta(P) \leq \delta'(P)$

redistributed density δ' :

dense triangles share their density with neighbors

 P^* of density δ^*

Daria Pchelina

Density of disc and sphere packings

Local density redistribution



 $\delta(P) \leq \delta^*$





 $\begin{array}{l} P \text{ of density } \delta(P) \leq \delta'(P) \\ \\ \forall \Delta, \ \delta'(\Delta) \leq \delta^* \end{array}$

Daria Pchelina

$\delta(P) \leq \delta'(P) \leq \delta^*$

redistributed density δ' :

dense triangles share their density with neighbors

Density of disc and sphere packings



 P^* of density δ^*

10 / 24

Verifying inequalities on compact sets

How to check $\delta'(\Delta) \leq \delta^*$ on each possible triangle Δ ? (there is a continuum of them)

Verifying inequalities on compact sets

How to check $\delta'(\Delta) \leq \delta^*$ on each possible triangle Δ ? (there is a continuum of them)

FM-triangulation properties + saturation \Rightarrow uniform bound on edge length



Verifying inequalities on compact sets

How to check $\delta'(\Delta) \leq \delta^*$ on each possible triangle Δ ? (there is a continuum of them)

FM-triangulation properties + saturation \Rightarrow uniform bound on edge length



- Interval arithmetic: to verify $\delta'(\Delta_{a,b,c}) \leq \delta^*$ for all $(a, b, c) \in [\underline{a}, \overline{a}] \times [\underline{b}, \overline{b}] \times [\underline{c}, \overline{c}]$, we verify $[\underline{\delta}, \overline{\delta}] \leq \delta^*$ where $[\underline{\delta}, \overline{\delta}] = \delta'(\Delta_{[\underline{a}, \overline{a}], [\underline{b}, \overline{b}], [\underline{c}, \overline{c}]})$
- If $\delta^* \in [\underline{\delta}, \overline{\delta}]$, recursive subdivision:



Our proof worked for these cases:































Density of disc and sphere packings

And these:



10

13 / 24

45 counter examples: flip-and-flow method



When the ratio of two discs is close enough to the ratio in a dense binary packing, we can pack these discs in a similar manner (non triangulated) and still get high density



ternary triangulated packing

counter example using only 2 discs $\delta > 0.937371 \ s \approx 0.121445$

 $\delta > 0.939305 \ s \approx 0.166169$

 $\delta > 0.918420 \ s \approx 0.240205$

Density of disc and sphere packings

14 / 24

Daria Pchelina

45 counter examples: flip-and-flow method



When the ratio of two discs is close enough to the ratio in a dense binary packing, we can pack these discs in a similar manner (non triangulated) and still get high density



 $\delta \approx 0.950308 \ r \approx 0.154701$

ternary triangulated packing

dense binary packing

Density of disc and sphere packings

 $\delta \approx 0.962430 \ r \approx 0.101021$

 $\delta \approx 0.931901 \ r \approx 0.280776$ 14 / 24

Daria Pchelina



Kepler conjecture: -packings

3D close 🔴-packing:



Daria Pchelina

Density of disc and sphere packings

15 / 24

Kepler conjecture: -packings





Kepler conjecture, 1611

Close packing is optimal.

 close packing is optimal among lattice packings 	Gauss, 1831
• 18th problem of the Hilbert's list	1900
 6 preprints by Hales and Ferguson > 180000 lines of code 	ArXiv 1998
• 13 reviewers, 4 years "99% certain"	<mark>1999–</mark> 2003
• published proof: 300 pages, 3 computer programs	DCG 2006
• formal proof: Flyspeck project (HOL Light)	2003-2014

15 / 24

Rock salt Oo-packings

cannonball packing



sphere

Rock salt Oo-packings

rock salt packing

rock salt spheres





Rock salt Oo-packings

rock salt packing

-Na⁺

rock salt spheres



Rock salt Oo-packings

rock salt packing

rock salt spheres



triangulated \rightarrow simplicial (contact graph is a "tetrahedration")

Fernique, 2019

The only simplicial 2-sphere packings are rock salt packings.



Rock salt Oo-packings

rock salt packing

rock salt spheres



triangulated \rightarrow simplicial (contact graph is a "tetrahedration")

Fernique, 2019

The only simplicial 2-sphere packings are rock salt packings.

Salt conjecture

open problem

Rock salt packing is optimal $\delta^* \approx 79\%$



Upper density bound for Oppackings in 2D

Florian, 1960

The density of a packing never exceeds the density in the following triangle:



Upper density bound for Oo-packings in 2D

Florian, 1960

The density of a packing never exceeds the density in the following triangle:

Proof:

• dimension reduction $(3 \rightarrow 1)$

Fejes Tóth, Mólnar, 1958

for any triangle, there is a denser triangle with at least two contacts between discs



Upper density bound for Oo-packings in 2D

Florian, 1960

The density of a packing never exceeds the density in the following triangle:

Proof:

• dimension reduction $(3 \rightarrow 1)$

Fejes Tóth, Mólnar, 1958

for any triangle, there is a denser triangle with at least two contacts between discs



Upper density bound for Oo-packings



Upper density bound for Oo-packings



Upper density bound for Oo-packings



Proof:

 dimension reduction (6 → 4): tetrahedron deflation + sphere sliding



Upper density bound for Oo-packings



Proof:

 dimension reduction (6 → 4): tetrahedron deflation + sphere sliding



Upper density bound for Oo-packings



Proof:

 dimension reduction (6 → 4): tetrahedron deflation + sphere sliding



Upper density bound for Oo-packings



Proof:

 dimension reduction (6 → 4): tetrahedron deflation + sphere sliding



• computer-assisted proof for tetrahedra with 2 contacts: recursive subdivision + interval arithmetic \approx 1000 lines of code

11h on 96 CPUs

19 / 24

Why the computations are so slow

interval arithmetic + huge formulas \rightarrow loss of precision

Why the computations are so slow

interval arithmetic + huge formulas \rightarrow loss of precision

Example: to compute the support sphere radius, we need to solve $Ar^2 + Br + C = 0$

 $A = -43^{2}b^{2}d^{2} + 43^{2}c^{2}d^{2} + 44b^{2}c^{2}d^{2} + 4d^{2}b^{2}c^{2} + 4b^{2}c^{2}c^{2} + 4b^{2}c^{2}c^{2} + 4b^{2}c^{2}d^{2}c^{2} + 4b^{$

$$\begin{split} B &= -Ac^{2}d^{2}r_{c} + Ab^{2}d^{2}r_{c} + Ac^{2}d^{2}r_{c} + Ab^{2}c^{2}r_{c} + Ab^{2}c^{2}r_{c} - Ac^{2}c^{2}r_{c} - Ac^{2}c^{2}r_{c} - Ac^{2}c^{2}r_{c} - Ac^{2}c^{2}r_{c} - Ac^{2}c^{2}r_{c} - Ac^{2}c^{2}r_{c} - Ac^{2}r_{c} - Ab^{2}r_{c} - Ac^{2}r_{c} - Ac^{2}r_{c} - Ab^{2}r_{c} - Ab^{2}r_{c$$

C = c'd - 2b'c'd'' + b'd - 2a'c'd'' - 2a'd'', - 2b'd'', + 2b'd''c', + 2c'd''', + 2b'd''', + 2a'd''', + 2a'd''', + 2a'd''', + 2b'd''', - 2a'd'', - 2a'd'', - 2a'd'', + 2b'd''', - 2a'd'', - 2a'd'',

Why the computations are so slow

interval arithmetic + huge formulas \rightarrow loss of precision

Example: to compute the support sphere radius, we need to solve $Ar^2 + Br + C = 0$

$$\begin{split} B &= -Ac^2 a^4 r_c + Ab^2 a^2 c^2 r_c + Ac^2 a^2 \\ &+ Ab^2 c^2 c^2 r_c + AB^2 b^4 r_c^2 r_c + AA^2 c^2 \\ &- Ab^2 a^2 r_c r_c^2 + Ab^2 c^2 r_c r_c^2 + Ab^2 \\ &- Ba^2 c^2 c^2 r_c + Ab^2 c^2 c^2 r_c + Ac^2 r^2 \\ &+ Aa^2 r^2 r_c^2 - Ac^2 b^2 c^2 r_c^2 - Ab^2 \\ &+ Aa^2 r^2 r_c^2 - Ac^2 r^2 c^2 r_c^2 - Ab^2 \\ &+ Aa^2 r^2 r_c^2 - Ac^2 r^2 r_c^2 - Ab^2 r^2 \\ &+ Ab^2 r^2 r_c^2 r_c - Ab^2 r^2 r_c^2 - Ab^2 r^2 \\ &- Ab^2 c^2 r_c^2 r_c + Ab^2 r^2 r_c^2 r_c - Ab r^2 \\ &- Ab^2 c^2 r_c^2 r_c + Ab^2 r^2 r_c^2 r_c - Ab r^2 \\ &- Ab^2 c^2 r_c^2 r_c + Ab^2 r^2 r_c^2 r_c - Ab r^2 \\ &- Ab^2 c^2 r_c^2 r_c + Ab^2 r^2 r_c^2 r_c - Ab r^2 \\ &- Ab^2 c^2 r_c^2 r_c + Ab^2 r^2 r_c^2 r_c - Ab r^2 \\ &- Ab^2 c^2 r_c^2 r_c + Ab^2 r^2 r_c^2 r_c - Ab r^2 \\ &- Ab^2 c^2 r_c^2 r_c + Ab^2 r^2 r_c^2 r_c - Ab r^2 \\ &- Ab^2 c^2 r_c^2 r_c + Ab^2 r^2 r_c^2 r_c - Ab r^2 \\ &- Ab^2 c^2 r_c^2 r_c + Ab^2 r^2 r_c^2 r_c - Ab r^2 \\ &- Ab^2 c^2 r_c^2 r_c + Ab^2 r^2 r_c^2 r_c - Ab r^2 \\ &- Ab^2 c^2 r_c^2 r_c + Ab^2 r^2 r_c^2 r_c - Ab r^2 \\ &- Ab^2 c^2 r_c^2 r_c + Ab^2 r^2 r_c^2 r_c - Ab r^2 \\ &- Ab^2 r^2 r_c^2 r_c + Ab^2 r^2 r_c^2 r_c - Ab r^2 r^2 r_c^2 r_c - Ab^2 r^2 r_c^2 r_c - Ab r^2 r_c^2 r_c^2 r_c - Ab r^2 r_c^2 r_c^2 r_c - Ab r^2 r_c^2 r_c^2 r_c^2 r_c - Ab r^2 r_c^2 r_c^$$

Thanks to dimension reduction:

compute with fixed radii and edge lengths, then "simplify" $r_x = r_y = r_z = r_w = 1$, a = b = c = 2: $A_{1111} = 4 (d^2 - e^2)^2 + 4f^4 + ((d^2 - 8)e^2 - 8d^2)f^2$ $B_{1111} = 8 (d^2 - e^2)^2 + 8f^4 + 2((d^2 - 8)e^2 - 8d^2)f^2$ $C_{1111} = d^2e^2f^2$

 $+4d^2f^2r_{1}r_{a}^{2}+4d^2br_{1}r_{a}^{2}-4b^2r_{1}r_{a}^{2}+4b^2c^2r_{1}r_{a}^{2}+4b^2d^2r_{1}r_{a}^{2}+4c^2d^2r_{1}r_{a}^{2}-8b^2d^2r_{1}r_{a}^{2}+4d^2f^2r_{1}r_{a}^{2}+4d^2d^2r_{1}r_{a}^{2}+4d^2d^2r_{1}r_{a}^{2}+4d^2r_{1}r_{a}^{2}-8d^2b^2r_{1}r_{a}^{2}+4d^2r_{1}r_{a}^{2}+8d^2r_{1}r_{a}^{2}+4d^2r_{1}r_{a}^{2}-8d^2b^2r_{1}r_{a}^{2}+4d^2r_{1}r_{a}^{2}+8d^2r_{1}r_{a}^{2}+4d^2r_{1}r_{a}^{2}-8d^2r_{1}r_{a}^{2}+4d^2r_{1}r_{a}^{2}+8d^2r_{1}r_{a}^{2}+4d^2r_{1}r_{a}^{2}+8d^2r_{1}r_{a}^{2}+4d^2r_{1}r_{a}^{2}+8d^2r_{1}r_{a}^{2}+4d^2r_{1}r_{a}^{2$

 $C = c^2 d = 2b^2 c^2 c^2 + c^2 b^2 c^2 + c^2 + c^2 + c^2 + c^2 b^2 + c^2 + c^$



Conclusion

Techniques



Computer assistance:



Conclusion

Open questions: packings and tilings

triangulated packings





 \sim



tilings by triangles

 $density = weighted \ proportion \ of \ tiles$

Daria Pchelina
Open questions: packings and tilings



density = weighted proportion of tiles

Triangulated Packing Problem

	excludes hexagonal packing
algebraic numbers represented by polynomials and intervals	<u> </u>
Given k disc radii $\overline{r_1, \cdots, r_k}$, is there a triangulated pa	acking of density $> \frac{\pi}{2\sqrt{3}}$

$\forall r_1, \cdots, r_k$ with triat (Wang algorithm: set	ngulated packings, one is periodic arch for a period)	\Rightarrow	decidable
$\exists r_1, \cdots, r_k$ whose tr	angulated packings are all aperiodic	\Rightarrow	undecidable?
Daria Pchelina	Density of disc and sphere packings		22 / 24

Open questions: packings and tilings



Density of disc and sphere packings

22 / 24

Other "spherical" questions: from pollen grains to kissing problem

Tammes 1930: configuration of pores on a pollen grain

spherical codes



maximize the number of spherical caps of a given radius on a sphere

Other "spherical" questions: from pollen grains to kissing problem

Tammes 1930: configuration of pores on a pollen grain

spherical codes



maximize the number of spherical caps of a given radius on a sphere

place n points on a sphere to maximize the distance between two nearest points

Other "spherical" questions: from pollen grains to kissing problem

Tammes 1930: configuration of pores on a pollen grain

spherical codes



maximize the number of spherical caps of a given radius on a sphere place *n* points on a sphere to maximize the distance between two nearest points find the smallest possible radius of a central sphere tangent to *n* unit spheres solved for n = 3, ..., 14, and 24 (1943 – 2015)

Other "spherical" questions: from pollen grains to kissing problem

Tammes 1930: configuration of pores on a pollen grain

spherical codes



maximize the number of spherical caps of a given radius on a sphere place n points on a sphere to maximize the distance between two nearest points find the smallest possible radius of a central sphere tangent to n unit spheres solved for n = 3, ..., 14, and 24 (1943 – 2015)

kissing number: how many unit spheres can touch the same unit central sphere in \mathbb{R}^d solved for d = 2:6, 3:



Other "spherical" questions: from pollen grains to kissing problem

Tammes 1930: configuration of pores on a pollen grain

spherical codes



maximize the number of spherical caps of a given radius on a sphere place n points on a sphere to maximize the distance between two nearest points find the smallest possible radius of a central sphere tangent to n unit spheres solved for n = 3, ..., 14, and 24 (1943 – 2015)

kissing number: how many unit spheres can touch the same unit central sphere in \mathbb{R}^d solved for d = 2:6, 3:12 (1953), 4:24 (2003), 8:240, 24:196560 (1979)

Other "spherical" questions: from pollen grains to kissing problem

Tammes 1930: configuration of pores on a pollen grain

spherical codes



maximize the number of spherical caps of a given radius on a sphere place n points on a sphere to maximize the distance between two nearest points find the smallest possible radius of a central sphere tangent to n unit spheres solved for n = 3, ..., 14, and 24 (1943 – 2015)

kissing number: how many unit spheres can touch the same unit central sphere in \mathbb{R}^d solved for d = 2:6, 3:12 (1953), 4:24 (2003), 8:240, 24:196560 (1979)



dodecahedral conjecture smallest Voronoi cell in sphere packing (proved in 2010)

23 / 24

Thank you for your attention!

50

١

5

50

50

۱

Daria Pchelina

50

Density of disc and sphere packings

24 / 24

(8)

S

How to find triangulated packings

packing is triangulated



each disc has a "corona"





How to find triangulated packings



To find disc sizes with triangulated packings, we run trough all possible combinations of symbolic coronas of two discs (finite number):

symbolic corona

(Fernique, Hashemi, Sizova 2019)

How to find triangulated packings



To find disc sizes with triangulated packings, we run trough all possible combinations of symbolic coronas of two discs (finite number):



(Fernique, Hashemi, Sizova 2019)